

**Important note:** *To be completed with reference to the Reporting Guidance Notes for Project Leaders: it is expected that this report will be about 10 pages in length, excluding annexes*

**Submission Deadline: 30<sup>th</sup> April 2017**

### **IWT Challenge Fund Project Information**

Project reference	<b>IWT019</b>
Project title	<b>Strengthen enforcement capacity to combat illegal wildlife trafficking in China</b>
Country/ies	China
Contract holder Institution	Beijing Normal University
Partner institution(s)	CITES Management Authority of China, Wildlife Conservation Association, CITES Scientific Authority of China and International Fund for Animal Welfare
IWT grant value	£300,000
Start/end dates of project	February 1, 2015-January 31, 2018
Reporting period (e.g. April 2016-Mar 2017) and number (e.g. Annual Report 1,2,3)	April 2016-Mar 2017 Annual Report 2
Project leader name	Li Zhang
Project website	
Report author(s) and date	Lijuan An, Xuan Yang and Li Zhang April 15, 2017

#### **1. Project rationale**

In recent years, with the development of a consumer economy, people's demand for wildlife products has grown substantially. The markets for consumption are increasing, and using wildlife as pets, for medicine and health care, and as food has become a status symbol and a fashionable lifestyle in China. As a result, wildlife trade has expanded quickly, and illegal wildlife trafficking has increased sharply. Large quantities of wild animals are now on the verge of extinction as a result of commercial development, such as pangolins (*Manis spp.*) and rhinos (*Ceratotherium spp.*).

The global wild animal trafficking is estimated to worth more than US\$8 billion a year, second only to the trade in illegal drugs and with profit margins more attractive than illegal arms dealing. Adding to the problem, government-enforced wildlife trade monitoring is significantly inadequate in China, making it difficult to assess the impact on wild animals domestically; relevant data obtained from consumers is also very scarce. Meanwhile, the coexistence of legal and illegal trades makes it difficult to monitor wild animal trade and distinguish illegal products on the market from the legal ones. Identifying animal species traded at the sales terminals, estimating trading

frequency, identifying species under protection or rare species, and assembling data on the countries and routes involved in trafficking are complex tasks that require support from a wide variety of sources.

The project will build the capacity of multi-lateral enforcement agencies on combating international illegal wildlife trafficking by providing systematic law enforcement trainings facilitated by BNU and partners NGOs including WCS, IUCN and the Nature University etc.

With the wildlife enforcement capacity enhanced in China supported by this project, increasing trend of smuggling of wildlife products from range countries into China would be strictly controlled by Chinese enforcement agencies. Meanwhile, threats such as poaching to those key species population in the wild would be suppressed. It is obviously benefiting those range countries to prevent their wildlife from illegal killing, especially elephants and rhinos in African states.

With our proposed wildlife enforcement training exchanges workshops between China and wildlife range countries, Chinese enforcement officers will exchange their experiences with rangers from other countries, and they will also learn the situation and challenges in other countries. It will help China's governmental agencies to understand the threats of poaching to other wildlife range states, and will engage Chinese overseas aid programs to support wildlife conservation projects in those ranger countries in future. It will also benefit local communities to seek for sustainable rural development opportunities rather than killing wildlife to profits in those countries potentially.

With the enforcement capacity enhanced in China supported by this project, African elephants and rhinos, as well as pangolin smuggling would be suppressed worldwide by strengthening enforcement capacity with well-trained Chinese wildlife enforcement officers at border. Wildlife trafficking will be shrunk and with less profit that will reduce the pressure of poaching to those endangered species living the field, and finally benefit to the species survival.



Figure 1. Cities hold wildlife enforcement trainings for Customs and Forest Police in the fiscal year 2015-2016 (red) and fiscal year 2016-2017 (blue) funded by IWT Challenge Fund and matching funds form BNU and project partners in China.

## 2. Project partnerships

Leading by Beijing Normal University and CITES Management Authority of China, in partnership with CITES Scientific Authority of China, Wildlife Conservation Society and International Fund for Animal, a core partners team was formed in February 2015 in Xi'an of Shanxi Province. The Principal Investigator of the project, Professor Li Zhang; Dr. Xianlin Meng, CITES CNMA Director General; Dr. Yan Zeng, CITES Scientific Authority Deputy Office Chief; Ms. Lishu Li, Senior Program Officer of WCS China; Mr. Jeff He, China Director of IFAW formed a leading group for the BNU IWT project, who worked closely to coordinate partnership with General Customs Administration, Forest Police Administration and State Forestry Administration and relevant governmental agencies and non-governmental organizations. The leading group makes decision on priority regions with critical needs to build wildlife law enforcement capacity, and coordinates all related resources to support activities under this project.

As the project implementation institute, BNU established a project implementation team including one program officer Ms. Lijuan An and one program assistant Ms. Xuan Yang, together with the project leader, to manage all financial and logistic support for project activities, as well as provided

free office space and project leader's staff salary as matching fund to the project. As the key governmental agencies, CITES CNMA worked with other governmental agencies to arrange the training courses for enforcement agencies, and provided training experts on CITES related international and domestic legislations to give lectures for trainees. CNMA also provided matching fund to co-sponsor couple of trainings in Kunming and Beihai. WCS and IFAW supported some of the training courses over the first year of the project by providing training materials and information from their international network that helped all trainees understand the international situation of illegal wildlife trafficking with most latest information and knowledge. WCS and IFAW also provided leveraging fund to support their staff's time and travels to participate the trainings and workshops hosted by the project. CITES Scientific Authority together with its host institution, Chinese Academy of Sciences, provided scientific supports with species identification tools and worked together with all partners of the project to develop training tool kits.

During the project period in the past two years, all partners worked closely and honestly. The core leading group leaders met once every two months, and they also made frequent communications via phone calls to coordinate the project activities. At the very beginning of the project, each partner may have their own working priorities and working styles. The leading group members and CITES branch office heads had a one-day meeting together in Xi'an to coordinate each partner's priority sites and analyze the critical needs for law enforcement capacity building program. BNU project leader also spent couple times to meet with all partners in person to work out training plan together. All partners also sit together to develop the training tools and tried to build all related necessary legislations, law enforcement case studies, and updated information from each partner etc. into the training materials.

BNU project leader also took the opportunity of chairing the China's NGO coalition of Save Wildlife in Trade to introduce the project to all members of the coalition, and engaged non-partners, such as TRAFFIC, Nature Resources Defence Commission (NRDC), Freeland Foundation (FF), The Nature Conservancy (TNC) and WildAid also participated several of BNU organized training courses attending as observers or providing training lectures. In April 2016, BNU won a grant of \$ USD from Critical Ecosystem Partnership Fund (CEFP) to facilitate NGOs' participation in supporting governmental agencies' wildlife law enforcement capacity, which is another leveraging fund to IWT challenge fund to this project.

### **3. Project progress**

#### Summary

With the support from IWT Challenge Fund, Beijing Normal University provided 10 wildlife enforcement training courses together with project partners: CITES Management Authority of China and its branch offices in 10 cities in Dongxing, Kunming, Tianshui, Guilin, Xishuangbanna,

Suining, Hefei, Beihai, Xi'an and Mianyang. In total about 700 wildlife law enforcement officers from Forest Police, Customs, Market Management Authority, Frontier Army and Wildlife Management Authority from 10 provinces participated these trainings. Representatives from International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW), Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS), The Nature Conservancy (TNC), WildAid, Natural Resources Defense Commission (NRDC) and TRAFFIC were invited to participate these trainings as lecturers or observers.

In addition, BNU supported CNMA to co-hosted China-Laos cross boundary wildlife law enforcement dialog meeting in Xishuangbanna of Yunnan Province in April 2016; and also supported CNMA to co-hosted China-Vietnam cross boundary wildlife law enforcement dialog and coordination meeting in Guilin of Guangxi Province border in October 2016. IWT project partner NGOs were also invited to participate these two inter-governments wildlife enforcement dialog together with other governmental enforcement agencies, and got chances to introduced their efforts on combatinng illegal wildlife trafficking, consumption reduction, public awareness and education in China.

### 3.1 Progress in carrying out project Activities

Output 1: Wildlife trade enforcement capacity of customs and enforcement agencies is enhanced	
Activity 1.1	Set up a training tool kit developing team with related governmental and NGOs experts
	Completed in the previous fiscal year
Activity 1.2	Conduct training needs assessment
	Completed in the previous fiscal year
Activity 1.3	Develop training materials and complete the training tool kit
	Completed in the previous fiscal year
Activity 1.4	Provide training courses for enforcement officers in key regions
	With the support from IWT Challenge Fund, Beijing Normal University provided 10 wildlife enforcement training courses together with project partners: CITES Management Authority of China and its branch offices in 10 cities in Dongxing, Kunming, Tianshui, Guilin, Xishuangbanna, Suining, Hefei, Beihai, Xi'an and Mianyang. In total about 700 wildlife law enforcement officers from Forest Police, Customs, Market Management Authority, Frontier Army and Wildlife Management Authority from 10 provinces participated these trainings. Representatives from International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW), Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS), The Nature Conservancy (TNC), WildAid, Natural Resources Defense Commission (NRDC) and TRAFFIC were invited to participate these trainings as lecturers or observers.
Activity 1.5	Assess the effectiveness of training courses every 3 months
	The BNU project team developed a questionnaire to monitor the effectiveness of

	<p>training courses (see supplementary -1). CNMA branch offices will distribute the questionnaire to trainees participated our training courses. The project team evaluated the feedback from the trainers every 3 months. The partner organizations including local CITES branch offices, Customs, and Forest Police also provided annual report on the effectiveness of our training courses with confiscation information and releveant experiences and acknologe sharing with all project partners together with NGOs involved in this project. This is a never happened to NGOs and other civil society supported simliar proeject before. We believe that it is one of the big achivement from this IWT sponsored project.</p>
--	--

<p><b>Output 2: NGO partners of Save Wildlife in Trade Network mainstreamed into the wildlife law enforcement efforts to combating illegal wildlife trade</b></p>	
<p><b>Activity 2.1</b></p>	<p><b>Hold inter-agencies enforcement workshop and invite NGO partners to participate</b></p> <p>BNU supported CNMA to co-hosted China-Laos cross boundary wildlife law enforcement dailog meeting in Xishuangbanna of Yunnan Province in April 2016; and also supported CNMA to co-hosted China-Vietnam cross boundary wildlife law enforcement dailog and coordination meeting in Guilin of Guangxi Province border in October 2016. IWT project partner NGOs were also invited to participate these two inter-governments wildlife enforcement dialog together with other governmental enforcement agencies, and got chances to introduced their efforts on combatinnng illegal wildlife trafficking, consumption reduction, public awareness and education in China.</p>
<p><b>Activity 2.2</b></p>	<p><b>Establish joint working group (NGOs and enforcement agencies) to prepare training toolkit</b></p> <p>Completed in the previous fiscal year</p>
<p><b>Activity 2.3</b></p>	<p><b>Through the joint working group, assess the effect of the training annually and update tool kit as necessary</b></p> <p>Together with CNMA, BNU hosted annual IWT project partners meeting at Xijiao Hotel in Beijing on March 22, 2017. All NGO partners of IWT project were met and reviewed the project progresses in the past fiscal year. BNU implementation team reported law enforcement trainings and project related actitives. CNMA reported feedbacks from law enforcement agencies who participated IWT funded trainings based on 52 questionnaires from trainees. The core team reviewed and approved the revised training materials and tool kit with updated revision of China Wildlife Protection Law, as well as the translation led by CITES Scientific Authority on the</p>

	new uplisted and downlisted species manual adopted by the CITES COP17 in 2016 for future trainings courses. All partners were also discussed and approved the training plan in the fiscal 2017-2018.
--	--

### 3.2 Progress towards project Outputs

Output 1	<p><b>Wildlife trade enforcement capacity of customs enforcement agencies is enhanced</b></p> <p>With the support from IWT Challenge Fund, Beijing Normal University co-hosted 10 wildlife enforcement training courses together with project partners: CITES Management Authority of China and its branch offices in 10 cities in Dongxing, Kunming, Tianshui, Guilin, Xishuangbanna, Suining, Hefei, Beihai, Xi'an and Mianyang. In total about 700 training tool kits provided to wildlife law enforcement officers from Forest Police, Customs, Market Management Authority, Frontier Army and Wildlife Management Authority from 10 provinces participated these trainings.</p> <p>BNU requested feedbacks from CITES local branch offices, Customs and Forest Policy in key areas, and all partners of the governmental law enforcement agencies reported their annual confiscations to the project core team. According to reports submitted by partners, the capacity of enforcement got strengthened after the two-year project period (see details from briefly translated the supplementary document 2-5). From the reports from Guangxi, it's shown that the local wildlife law enforcement agencies effectively confiscated several major seizures of wildlife products smuggling.</p>
Output 2	<p><b>NGO partners of Save Wildlife in Trade Network mainstreamed into the wildlife law enforcement efforts to combating illegal wildlife trade</b></p> <p>The IWT funded BNU project have various partners representing both governmental enforcement agencies and civil society. BNU project leader also took the opportunity of chairing the China's NGO coalition of Save Wildlife in Trade to introduce the project to all members of the coalition, and engaged non-partners, such as IUCN, WWF, TRAFFIC, Nature Resources Defence Commission (NRDC), Freeland Foundation (FF), The Nature Conservancy (TNC) and WildAid also participated several of BNU organized training courses attending as observers or providing training lectures. Meanwhile, during continuous efforts by the project core team in the past two years, related governmental agencies also</p>

accepted NGO partners in their daily wildlife law enforcement works. In April 2016, all the project NGO partners got invited by the project core team to participated China-Laos CITES implementation and wildlife trafficking control dialog meeting in Xishuangbanna of Yunnan Province together with governmental officials from State Forestry Administration, Customs, Forest Police and related provincial departments from Yunnan; in October 2016, all project NGO partners also got invited and participated the China-Vietnam cross boundary wildlife trafficking control and CITES implementation dialog meeting in Guilin of Guangxi Province together with related governmental officials from State Forestry Administration, Customs, Forest Police, Tourism Administration, State Administration of Industry and Commerce, Guangxi Provincial Anti-Smuggling Office and related departments from the province. In January 2017, CITES CNMA hosted an annual project planning meeting and invited all BNU-IWT project partners to review the annual reports provided by enforcement agencies from key provinces, and the discussed the annual planning for 2017-2018 of the project funded by IWT and with leverage funding provided by CNMA, WCS, IFAW and BNU-Critical Ecosystem Partnership Fund. With the support from IWT fund in the past two years, all partners of the project including governmental agencies and civil society have strengthened the partnership and trust among each other.

The local governmental enforcement agencies used to be concerned about the involvement of NGOs in their daily wildlife trafficking control works years ago. Although they used to be invited by NGOs to participate trainings and workshops, there was still an invisible wall between the two sides.

After two years project period, the working team from both governmental agencies and NGOs worked closed in daily project planning, coordinating, implementing and monitoring. Some of them becomes close friends and they started actively exchange information and enforcement needs from the local ports. Local enforcement officer also actively raised questions and problems they met during using the training tools in their daily law enforcement actions to NGO partners, and also provided solid suggestions on how to improve the training tools after each training courses.

All of above, indicated that NGO partners of Save Wildlife in Trade Network has been mainstreamed into the wildlife law enforcement efforts to combating illegal wildlife trade during the implementation of this IWT project in the past two years.



### 3.3 Progress towards the project Outcome

The 2016-2017 fiscal year was a critical year for many endangered wildlife species targeted by the BNU project funded by IWT crisis fund.

First of all, China's policy on domestic ivory trade is shaking after the Prince William's visit to China who raised the global ivory trade and African elephant crisis to China President XI Jinping, and the following joint commitment to significantly and timely close each country's domestic ivory market made by Xi together with US President Obama in 2016. The project NGO partners worked closely with China's State Forestry Administration and related enforcement agencies to finalise the ivory trade ban policy and provided suggestions on how to implement the ban with proper preparations. With leverage funding from BNU, IFAW and WCS, three of IWT partners monitored the ivory trade markets in major cities and provided key information of illegal ivory trade to related governmental enforcement agencies. On December 29, 2016 the State Council of China finally issued a notice on the orderly cessation of commercial processing and sale of ivory and ivory products by the end of 2017 (see Supplimentary 6). It is significant success of all IWT partners who were working hard on combating illegal ivory trafficking and engaging the government of China to shut down all of its domestic ivory market. Through each of IWT funded wildlife law enforcement courses in the past two years, all NGO partners would mention the trend of global ivory smuggling, elephant poaching and the importance of joint efforts and collaborations among enforcement agencies in the key regions on combating illegal ivory trade. According to the enforcement data reports provided by IWT partners from key regions, several ivory smuggling cases got confiscated by local customs and forest police (see the supplementary 2-5), and anti-smuggling of ivory products is one of important working field in almost all enforcement agencies involved in BNU-IWT project.

Second, all IWT partners were also working on the uplisting of pangolin species under the CITES Appendix I category to promote the law enforcement importance degree toward pangolin species in China. The IWT project working team also built pangolin related knowledge and species identification information into the training tool kits provide to enforcement officers from Customs, Forest Police officers and market management officers during our training courses in 2016-2017 fiscal year. After the parties of CITES approved proposal to uplist all pangolin species to Appendix I, our governmental law enforcement partners also modulated the intensity of punishment of pangolin smugglings. In Guangxi Province, couple of illegal pangolin trafficking cases got confiscated by local forest police officers after our trainings.

All of above indicated the BNU-IWT project are moving towards the project outcome with efforts by all IWT partners from both governmental agencies and civil society.

### 3.4 Monitoring of assumptions

Assumption 1	Number of CITES enforcement seizures for African elephants, rhinos and pangolins increased at the beginning as the result of enforcement capacity enhanced, but the number may reduce gradually after certain period as the result of the illegal wildlife trade reduced.
Comments	It is clearly shown that the enforcement seizures of endangered wildlife products got declined in some key regions after two years intensive training courses for local customs officers, forest policemen and market management officers supported by the BNU-IWT project with efforts of all partners. With improvement of China's policy on its entirely domestic ivory trade ban taking place by end of 2017, as well as the punishment on pangolin smuggling upgraded after CITES conference of parties up-listed all pangolin species from Appendix II to I, we believe the number of wildlife confiscations would be reduced gradually due to the enhanced wildlife enforcement and the result of the project outcome.
Assumption 2	Expectation of civil society on governmental agencies' wildlife law enforcement capacity could be higher than its reality even after the improvement. It's important to choose correct measurement at the start of the project.
Comments	Civil society partners used to be blocked outside the main stream of wildlife law enforcement led by the government and NGOs were not satisfied with the capacity and cooperation of governmental agencies, which was clearly shown in the questionnaire survey before the start of our project in early 2015. With the two years project, this situation got changed significantly according to the efforts of the project core team. IWT NGO partners now worked closely with governmental wildlife law enforcement agencies, and got invited by the government to participate inter-governmental agencies' annual wildlife law enforcement coordination meeting, as well as China-Laos and China-Vietnam CITES enforcement and cooperation dialog meeting together with related governmental agencies in this fiscal year. It will also change the attitude of civil society to the governmental enforcement agencies, which is happening since the IWT project launched.
Assumption 3	Inter-agencies joint/coordinated enforcement operations may be easy to conduct at local level but difficult to implement at national level.
Comments	After the establishment of provincial CITES law enforcement networks in Guangzhou, Guangxi, Sichuan and Shanxi, a national wildlife enforcement annual meeting was established led by CITES CNMA to coordinate nationwide inter-agencies enforcement operations, and some of IWT NGO partners were also invited to participate the meeting in Yanan in May 2016.

The project leading group will continue work together to evaluate these assumptions and would love to discuss this with IWT Challenge Fund management team to develop more accurate indicators to monitor and assess the success of the project.

#### **4. Impact: achievement of positive impact on illegal wildlife trade and poverty alleviation**

Impact in your original application form is: with the enforcement capacity enhanced in China supported by this project, African elephants and rhinos, as well as pangolin smuggling would be suppressed worldwide by strengthening enforcement capacity with well trained Chinese wildlife enforcement officers at border. Wildlife trafficking will be shrunk and with less profit that will reduce the pressure of poaching to those endangered species living the field, and finally benefit to the species survival.

With the contribution of the BNU project, more wildlife law enforcement officers will be trained and more illegal wildlife smuggled across the borders between China and its neighbouring countries will be confiscated. It will close the door for most of the illegal wildlife projects in the consuming country like China, and devalue the wildlife products in the money chain of the illegal wildlife trafficking, so that the poaching pressure in species resource countries will be reduced gradually.

People living in the wildlife resource countries may make money relying on poaching wildlife for benefits along the illegal wildlife trafficking. After the declining of illegal wildlife trade in its supply chains with the strengthening of law enforcement in consuming country, local people will find other ways to make livings with a sustainable way. China together with countries have committed to provide funding to support wildlife conservation in African states, and more funding is available for those wildlife resource countries to support alternative livelihood development and poverty alleviation. This BNU project is not directly support these works. However, it will promote the capacity of Chinese enforcement agencies working together with NGO partners to block the supply chains of illegal wildlife trafficking that will benefit a higher level impact in long term.

#### **5. Project support to the IWT Challenge Fund Objectives and commitments under the London Declaration and Kasane Statement**

The project supported 10 wildlife enforcement training courses together with project partners, in total about 700 wildlife law enforcement officers from Forest Police, Customs, Market Management Authority, Frontier Army and Wildlife Management Authority participated these trainings in the fiscal year 2016-2-17. Civil society including International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW), Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS), The Nature Conservancy (TNC), WildAid, Natural Resources

Defense Commission (NRDC), WWF/TRAFFIC, Institute of Zoology of Chinese Academy of Sciences, China's Academy of Forestry, University of China Forest Police and Beijing Normal University were invited to participate these trainings as lecturers or observers. These efforts lead to the rapid strengthening of law enforcement capacity in key regions in China.

Meanwhile, all the project NGO partners got invited by the project core team to participated China-Laos CITES implementation and wildlife trafficking control dialog meeting in Xishuangbanna of Yunnan Province together with governmental officials from State Forestry Administration, Customs, Forest Police and related provincial departments from Yunnan in April 2016. All project NGO partners also got invited and participated the China-Vietnam cross boundary wildlife trafficking control and CITES implementation dialog meeting in Guilin of Guangxi Province together with related governmental officials from State Forestry Administration, Customs, Forest Police, Tourism Administration, State Administration of Industry and Commerce, Guangxi Provincial Anti-Smuggling Office and related departments from the province in October 2016. With the increasing dialog between China and its neighbouring countries in Southeast Asia facilitated by IWT NGO partners, it will strengthen the cross boundary CITES law enforcement in the region, which was the solid evidence of IWT funded project to support the implementation of London Declaration and Kasane Statement on the ground.

## **6. Impact on species in focus**

In the fiscal year 2016-2017, all project partners were working closely on combating illegal wildlife trafficking in key regions focusing on African rhino, elephant and pangolin species and their products. According to reports from Customs, Forest Police and CITES Branch Offices provided to BNU project core team, several cases of confiscations conducted led by BNU-IWT project trained forest police officers in Guangxi. Besides elephant ivory products, rosewood and sandalwood those hard-wood tree species recently uplisted to CITES Appendix II were also confiscated during the actions. Enforcement officers from key regions in Guangdong, Guangxi, Yunnan, Shanxi, Guansu and Qinghai involved in regional enforcement actions were got trained in our projects in partnership with CITES CNMA. Their experiences gained from the IWT training program with tool kits provided helped those enforcement officers in their daily, and indeed benefit for those endangered species suffered in illegal wildlife trafficking. All of these wildlife are CITES Appendix species. With more enforcement officers trained by this IWT Challenge Fund supported capacity building project, we believe that more endangered species will benefit from the declining of illegal wildlife trafficking followed by reducing of poaching in their original range states.

In addition, the project NGO partners worked closely with China's State Forestry Administration and related governmental agencies to finalise the ivory trade ban policy and provided suggestions on how to implement the ban with proper preparations. With leverage funding from BNU, IFAW

and WCS, three of IWT partners monitored the ivory trade markets in major cities and provided key information of illegal ivory trade to related governmental enforcement agencies. IWT funded wildlife law enforcement courses in the past two years, all NGO partners would mention the trend of global ivory smuggling, elephant poaching and the importance of joint efforts and collaborations among enforcement agencies in the key regions on combating illegal ivory trade. According the enforcement data reports provided by IWT partners from key regions, several ivory smuggling cases got confiscated by local customs and forest police (see the supplementary 2-5), and anti-smuggling of ivory products is one of important working field in almost all enforcement agencies involved in BNU-IWT project. On December 29, 2016 the State Council of China finally issued a notice on the orderly cessation of commercial processing and sale of ivory and ivory products by the end of 2017 (see Supplementary 6). It is significant success of all IWT partners who were working hard on combating illegal ivory trafficking and engaging the government of China to shut down all of its domestic ivory market that would definitely benefit for all African elephants species.

Furthermore, all IWT partners were also working on the uplisting of pangoline species from the CITES Appendix II to Appendix I category to promote the law enforcement importance degree toward pangolin species worldwide. The IWT project working team also built pangolin related knowledge and species identification information into the training tool kits provide to enforcement officers from Customs, Forest Police officers and market management officers during our training courses in 2016-2017 fiscal year. After the parties of CITSE approved proposal to uplist all pangolin species to Appendix I, our governmental law enforcement partners also modulated the intensity of punishment of pangolin smugglings that would benefit for all pangolin species' survival in future.

## **7. Project support to poverty alleviation**

People living in the wildlife range countries may make limited money relying on poaching wildlife for benefits along with the illegal wildlife trafficking. After the declining of illegal wildlife trade in its supply chains with the strengthening of law enforcement in consuming country, local people will find other ways to make livings with a sustainable way. China together with countries have committed to provide funding to support wildlife conservation in African states, and more funding is available for those wildlife resource countries to support alternative livelihood development and poverty alleviation. This BNU project is not directly support these works, however, it will promote the capacity of Chinese enforcement agencies working together with NGO partners to block the supply chains of illegal wildlife trafficking that will benefit communities in range countries live in a more sustainable way with a healthy eco-system in long term.

## **8. Consideration of gender equality issues**

The university secured the right of well being of the staff who are working for the project; and will ensure both genders of woman and man have the equal opportunity working for the project.

Currently, two IWT Challenge Fund supported project staffs are both women who worked together with project leaders and partners to manage and coordinate the daily work of the project. During all of the training courses, both man and woman equally have right to take the trainings.

## **9. Monitoring and evaluation**

After each of our training course, questionnaires were distributed to trainees randomly to evaluate the effectiveness of each course by project staff (Questionnaires attached to this report as the supplimentary 1). The results will get back to project core team to evaluate the quality of the training materials and the course itself. BNU also requested local host organization to provide all trainees' list with signatures to check the quantity of the enforcement officers participated in each course. In the recent project partners meeting hosted at BNU office, all NGO partners are satisfied with the collaboration with CITES CNMA and related governmental enforcement agencies involved in the project. On the other hand, governmental agencies also invited NGO partners to participate national inter-governmental agencies' CITES implementation coordination network meeting in Yanan of Shanxi Province, as well as invited NGO partners to participated China-Laos and China-Vietnam CITES enforcement dialog meetings to share information and experiences. It is indicated that civil society and their efforts on combating illegal wildlife trade have been mainstreamed together with the governmental agencies.

## **10. Lessons learnt**

Since this fiscal, CITES CNMA provided 600,000 RMB as matching fund to support wildlife enforcement capacity building program outside BNU-IWT project funded areas. At the very beginning, CNMA planned to combine the two fundings together and distribute the resources to its branch offices with their own training plan. The project core team set up a annual planning meeting together with CNMA and all NGO partners involved. We identified Guangxi, Yunnan, Sichuan, Qinghai, Gansu and Shanxi as our priority areas to conduct the trainings according to the training needs assessment and feedbacks from the previous fiscal year. It took couple of weeks BNU project leader and project core team working together with CNMA to revise its training plan to fit with our needs. With our efforts, CNMA finally agreed that IWT project core team to pick up and fund our priority regions and then their funding will go to support other regions. We learned from this case that when our major governmental partner invested their funding to support the project, they may willing to dominate the whole processes. But the project leader and members from the core project team need to insist the project priority based on our need assessment.

## **11. Actions taken in response to previous reviews (if applicable)**

The project core team organized a meeting and discussed the review comments to the annual report of 2015-2106, especially discussed on how to develop solid indicators to measure the project outcomes. After a hot discussion, partners from both civil society and governmental agencies agreed that besides the numbers of wildlife enforcement confiscation, any policy

improvement and change could be also considered as the intermediate indicator leads to final outcome. Meanwhile, all partners agreed to strengthen the training effectiveness evaluation and monitoring after each course. In addition, the core team would also ask enforcement agencies from key regions to submit their annual report. The core team could get feedbacks from both individual trainees and the law enforcement agencies so that the team could improve the courses with targeted needs from local enforcement agencies and officers.

## **12. Other comments on progress not covered elsewhere**

This is the second fiscal year of the BNU IWT project. The project core team actively raised leverage funding from sponsor organization like CEPF and project partner like CNMA etc. The project team started to plan the next step of the work after the running out of IWT funding in 2018. The project partners agreed that the law enforcement capacity building need is still there even after the three-year intensive support from IWT fund through this BNU project. Considering the size of the country and the challenge of wildlife trafficking through out the border between China and neighbouring countries, the continuous law enforcement engagement is highly recommended to sponsor entities from both public side and private sectors. The project core team will figure out priority regions to continue to work based on the outputs from this three-year project, which will provide guideline on combating illegal wildlife trade in China in future.

## **13. Sustainability and legacy**

All training materials including species identification smart phone APP, wildlife law and legislation clippings, wildlife crime enforcement technical training manuals were provided to all trainees and governmental agencies for free. Due to the sensitivity and concerns about the leakage of the wildlife crime investigation, governmental agencies and project core team changed the mind to build a public website as an open access for the downloading of all training material. Instead of the website, the project team produced flash disk with all training materials to distribute to all trainees during the courses. This will secure those sensitive technical materials would not be leaked. Meanwhile, CEPF CNMA also made their contribution to leverage RMB (approximately £ GBP) to duplicate law enforcement training courses in other provinces not covered by BNU-IWT project areas.

The project leader and core team partners also took any opportunity to introduce the project to related civil society and potential donors over the past fiscal year 2016-2017. Some NGOs such as WildAid, Natural Resources Defense Commission (NRDC) and Jane Goodall Institute (JGI) showed their interests to participate our trainings, and some of them such as NRDC also offered their technical support to join the project team. BNU team also worked hard to approach sponsor organization to raise leverage fund to support the project. In May 2016, BNU gained a grant of \$ USD from Critical Ecosystem Partnership Fund (CEPF) to support civil society's involvement and mainstream in the wildlife law enforcement. Although CEPF grant could not support any activities

of the governmental enforcement agencies, it would be a timely leverage fund to the project team in the next fiscal to facilitate NGO partners' travels and accommodations during the training courses and governmental hosted meetings.

#### 14. IWT Challenge Fund Identity

All training materials including training keynote presentations and training manuals developed for the project were printed with acknowledgment for the support from IWT Challenge Fund and UK DEFRA. The project leader and leading working group members emphasized and acknowledged UK Government and the support from IWT Challenge Fund in each of the training courses provided for wildlife enforcement officers, and the UK Government was also recognised as the funder of this project.

**Table 1: Project expenditure during the reporting period (April 2016-March 2017)**

Project spend (indicative) since last annual report	2016/17 Grant (£)	2016/17 Total actual IWT Costs (£)	Variance %	Comments (please explain significant variances)
Staff costs (see below)				
Consultancy costs				
Overhead Costs				
Travel and subsistence				
Operating Costs				
Capital items (see below)				
Others (see below)				
<b>TOTAL</b>				

#### 15. OPTIONAL: Outstanding achievements of your project during the reporting period (300-400 words maximum). This section may be used for publicity purposes

I agree for the IWT Secretariat to publish the content of this section.

With the support from IWT Challenge Fund, Beijing Normal University provided 10 wildlife enforcement training courses together with project partners in 10 cities in Dongxing, Kunming, Tianshui, Guilin, Xishuangbanna, Suining, Hefei, Beihai, Xi'an and Mianyang. In total over 700 wildlife law enforcement officers from Forest Police, Customs, Market Management Authority, Frontier Army and Wildlife Management Authority from 14 provinces participated these trainings. Representatives from International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW), Wildlife Conservation Society



(WCS), The Nature Conservancy (TNC), WildAid, Natural Resources Defense Commission (NRDC) and TRAFFIC were invited to participate these trainings as lecturers or observers.

BNU supported CNMA to co-hosted China-Laos cross boundary wildlife law enforcement dialog meeting in Xishuangbanna of Yunnan Province, and also supported CNMA to co-hosted China-Vietnam cross boundary wildlife law enforcement dialog and coordination meeting in Guilin of Guangxi Province border in 2016. IWT project NGO partners were also invited to participate these two inter-governments wildlife enforcement dialog together with other governmental enforcement agencies, and got chances to introduced their efforts on combatinng illegal wildlife trafficking, consumption reduction, public awareness and education in China. It was indicated that civil society were mainstreamed into the wildlife enforcement on combating illegal wildlife trafficking in China.

## Annex 1: Report of progress and achievements against Logical Framework for Financial Year 2016-2017

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p><b>Impact</b></p> <p>Illegal wildlife trade was reduced.</p>		<p>With efforts of all project partners including governmental agencies and civil society, Government of China announced to close all its domestic ivory market by the end of 2017. Meanwhile, all pangolin species were uplisted from CITES Appendix II to Appendix I with efforts of CNMA and all NGO project partners. These two important policy changes as the intermediate level outcome that would significantly lead the project to achieve its outcome.</p>	
<p><b>Outcome</b></p> <p>Increased successful seizures of illegal international wildlife trafficking.</p>	<p>Reports provided by the project partner CNMA on CITES enforcement cases and seizures for African elephants, rhinos and pangolin confiscated by customs and forest police increased.</p> <p>Level of civil society satisfaction with and trust in law enforcement agencies upgraded by the comparison analysis results from the questionnaire assessment at the start and repeated at the end of the project.</p> <p>3 to 5 inter-agencies joint/coordinated enforcement operations during the</p>	<p>Annual report provided by law enforcement agencies showed the increased illegal wildlife confiscations in key regions after the training provided.</p> <p>Civil society partners used to by blocked outside the main stream of wildlife law enforcement led by the government and NGOs were not satisfied with the capacity and cooperation of</p>	<p>(Highlight key actions planned for next period)</p> <p>1) BNU will continue to support the dialog meeting between China law enforcement agencies with counterparts from neighbouring countries.</p> <p>2) NGO partners will be invited to</p>

	<p>project period (at least once a year).</p>	<p>governmental agencies, which was clearly shown in the questionnaire survey before the start of our project in early 2015. With the two years project, this situation got changed significantly according to the efforts of the project core team. IWT NGO partners now worked closely with governmental wildlife law enforcement agencies, and got invited by the government to participate inter-governmental agencies' annual wildlife law enforcement coordination meeting, as well as China-Laos and China-Vietnam CITES enforcement and cooperation dialog meetin together with related governemntal agencies in this fiscal year</p>	<p>participate these inter-governmental dialog meeting on CITES implementation through the BNU-IWT project partnership.</p> <p>3) CITES CNMA as the key governmental partner of the project will continue to ensure NGO partners will be invited to participate annual inter-governmental agencies' wildlife trafficking enforcement meeting</p>
<p><b>Output 1.</b> Wildlife trade enforcement capacity of customs enforcement agencies is enhanced</p>	<p>Wildlife law enforcement tool kit jointly developed by NGOs and governmental partners by month 3 and 400 kits distributed to wildlife enforcement officers annually.</p> <p>300-400 women and men enforcement officers trained on the tool kit each year through the project</p> <p>CITES CNMA prepare plan for continued financing of capacity support programme by end of the</p>	<p>With the support from IWT Challenge Fund, Beijing Normal University co-hosted 10 wildlife enforcement training courses together with project partners: CITES Management Authority of China and its branch offices in 10 cities in Dongxing, Kunming, Tianshui, Guilin, Xishuangbanna, Suining, Hefei, Beihai, Xi'an and Mianyang. In total about 700 training tool kits provided to wildlife law enforcement officers from Forest Police, Customs, Market Management Authority, Frontier Army and Wildlife Management Authority from 10 provinces participated these trainings.</p> <p>BNU requested feedbacks from CITES local branch offices, Customs and Forest</p>	

	project.	Policy in key areas, and all partners of the governmental law enforcement agencies reported their annual confiscations to the project core team. According to reports submitted by partners, the capacity of enforcement got strengthened after the two-year project period (see details from briefly translated the supplementary document 2-5). From the reports from Guangxi, it's shown that the local wildlife law enforcement agencies effectively confiscated several major seizures of wildlife products smuggling. CITES CNMA also provided RMB to leverage the IWT fund to support enforcement capacity building program outside BNU project areas.
Activity 1.1	Set up a training tool kit developing team with related governmental and NGOs experts	Completed
Activity 1.2	Conduct training needs assessment	Completed
Activity 1.3	Develop training materials and complete the training tool kit	Completed
Activity 1.4	Provide training courses for enforcement officers in key regions	Completed
Activity 1.5	Assess the effectiveness of training courses every 3 months	Completed
<b>Output 2.</b>	At least one inter-agency wildlife enforcement workshop (including NGO participation) held each year. NGO-Enforcement Agency joint training working group established by month 12 and annual meetings held to review results of capacity improvements and update	The IWT funded BNU project have various partners representing both governmental enforcement agencies and civil society. BNU project leader also took the opportunity of chairing the China's NGO coalition of Save Wildlife in Trade to introduce the project to all members of the coalition, and engaged non-partners, such as IUCN, WWF, TRAFFIC, Nature Resources Defence Commission (NRDC), Freeland Foundation (FF), The Nature Conservancy (TNC) and WildAid
NGO partners of Save Wildlife in Trade Network mainstreamed into the wildlife law enforcement efforts to combating illegal wildlife trade		

	<p>tools as necessary.</p>	<p>also participated several of BNU organized training courses attending as observers or providing training lectures. Meanwhile, during continuous efforts by the project core team in the past two years, related governmental agencies also accepted NGO partners in their daily wildlife law enforcement works. In April 2016, all the project NGO partners got invited by the project core team to participated China-Laos CITES implementation and wildlife trafficking control dialog meeting in Xishuangbanna of Yunnan Province together with governmental officials from State Forestry Administration, Customs, Forest Police and related provincial departments from Yunnan; in October 2016, all project NGO partners also got invited and participated the China-Vietnam cross boundary wildlife trafficking control and CITES implementation dialog meeting in Guilin of Guangxi Province together with related governmental officials from State Forestry Administration, Customs, Forest Police, Tourism Administration, State Administration of Industry and Commerce, Guangxi Provincial Anti-Smuggling Office and related departments from the province. In January 2017, CITES CNMA hosted an annual project planning meeting and invited all BNU-IWT project partners to review the annual reports provided by enforcement agencies from key provinces, and the discussed the annual planning for 2017-2018 of the project funded by IWT and with leverage funding provided by CNMA, WCS, IFAW and BNU-Critical Ecosystem Partnership Fund. With the support from IWT fund in the past two years, all partners of the project including governmental agencies and civil society have strengthened the partnership and trust among each other.</p> <p>The local governmental enforcement agencies used to be concerned about the involvement of NGOs in their daily wildlife trafficking control works years ago. Although they used to be invited by NGOs to participate trainings and</p>
--	----------------------------	---

		<p>workshops, there was still an invisible wall between the two sides.</p> <p>After two years project period, the working team from both governmental agencies and NGOs worked closed in daily project planning, coordinating, implementing and monitoring. Some of them becomes close friends and they started activiely exchange information and enforcement needs from the local ports. Local enforcement officer also activiely raised questions and problems they met during using the training tools in their daily law enforcement actions to NGO partners, and also provided solid suggestions on how to improve the training tools after each training coures.</p> <p>All of the above, indicated that NGO partners of Save Wildlife in Trade Network has been mainstreamed into the wildlife law enforcement efforts to combating illegal wildlife trade during the implementation of this IWT project in the past two years.</p>
<p>Activity 2.1</p> <p>Hold inter-agencies enforcement workshop and invite NGO partners to participate</p>		<p>Completed</p>
<p>Activity 2.2</p> <p>Establish joint working group (NGOs and enforcement agencies) to prepare training toolkit</p>		<p>Completed</p>
<p>Activity 2.3</p> <p>Through the joint working group, assess the effect of the training annually and update tool kit as necessary</p>		<p>Completed</p>

## Annex 2: Project's full current logframe as presented in the application form (unless changes have been agreed)

*N.B. if your application's logframe is presented in a different format in your application, please transpose into the below template. Please feel free to contact [IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk](mailto:IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk) if you have any questions regarding this.*

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
<b>Impact:</b> Illegal wildlife trade was reduced			
<b>Outcome:</b> Increased successful seizures of illegal international wildlife trafficking	<p>1) Number of CITES related seizures for African elephants, rhinos and pangolin increased in year-on-year recorded by target agencies</p> <p>2) Level of civil society satisfaction with and trust in law enforcement agencies upgraded by end of the project (measured at the start and repeated at the end of the project).</p> <p>3) Level of cooperation between target enforcement agencies improved by end of the project (measured by number of joint/coordinated enforcement operations each year)</p>	<p>1) Reports provided by the project partner CNMA on CITES enforcement cases and seizures for African elephants, rhinos and pangolin confiscated by customs and forest police increased.</p> <p>2) Level of civil society satisfaction with and trust in law enforcement agencies upgraded by the comparison analysis results from the questionnaire assessment at the start and repeated at the end of the project.</p> <p>3) 3 to 5 inter-agencies joint/coordinated enforcement operations during the project period (at least once a year).</p>	<p>1) Number of CITES enforcement seizures for African elephants, rhinos and pangolins increased at the beginning as the result of enforcement capacity enhanced, but the number may reduce gradually after certain period as the result of the illegal wildlife trade reduced.</p> <p>2) Expectation of civil society on governmental agencies' wildlife law enforcement capacity could be higher than its reality even after the improvement. It's important to choose correct measurement at the start of the project.</p> <p>3) Inter-agencies joint/coordinated enforcement operations may be easy to conduct at local level but difficult to implement at national level.</p>
<b>Output 1</b> Wildlife trade enforcement capacity of customs enforcement agencies is enhanced	<p>1.1 Wildlife law enforcement tool kit jointly developed by NGOs and governmental partners by month 3 and 400 kits distributed to wildlife enforcement officers annually</p> <p>1.2 About 300-400 women and men enforcement officers trained on the tool kit each year through the project</p>	<p>1.1 About 1200 training tool kits developed and distributed to enforcement officers</p> <p>1.2 In total 15-20 trainings provided for enforcement agencies in key region</p>	<p>1. It may take extra time to complete the training tool kit that may delay the start of the training courses. The workgroup will monitor the progress of the training tool kit development close.</p> <p>2. Intensive trainings may be difficult to arrange in some of the key regions due to local agencies' busy daily work. CNMA will coordinate with local enforcement agencies to have a better</p>

	1.3 CITES CNMA prepare plan for continued financing of capacity support programme by end of the project		arrangement for our planned trainings
<b>Output 2</b> NGO partners of Save Wildlife in Trade Network mainstreamed into the wildlife law enforcement efforts to combating illegal wildlife trade	2.1 At least one inter-agency wildlife enforcement workshop (including NGO participation) held each year 2.2 NGO-Enforcement Agency joint training working group established by month 12 and annual meetings held to review results of capacity improvements and update tools as necessary	2.1 Three inter-governmental agencies wildlife enforcement workshop with NGOs involved.	1. Some governmental agencies may have concerns of get NGOs participate the annual wildlife enforcement meetings. CNMA will coordinate and host the workshop together with BNU. The project partners in will build trust and partnership with related enforcement agencies during the daily training programs.
<p><b>Activities</b> (each activity is numbered according to the output that it will contribute towards, for example 1.1, 1.2 and 1.3 are contributing to Output 1)</p> <p>1.1 Set up a training tool kit developing team with related governmental and NGOs experts</p> <p>1.2 Conduct training needs assessment</p> <p>1.3 Develop training materials and complete the training tool kit</p> <p>1.4 Provide training courses for enforcement officers in key regions</p> <p>1.5 Assess the effectiveness of training courses every 3 months</p> <p>2.1 Hold inter-agencies enforcement workshop and invite NGO partners to participate</p> <p>2.2 Establish joint working group (NGOs and enforcement agencies) to prepare training toolkit</p> <p>2.3 Through the joint working group, assess the effect of the training annually and update tool kit as necessary</p>			



### **Annex 3 Standard Measures**

In future years it is our intention to develop a series of standard measures in order to collate some of the quantitative measures of activity, input and output of IWT projects. These will not be measures of the impact or effectiveness of IWT projects but will contribute to a longer term dataset for Defra to draw upon. The collection of standard measures data will be important as it will allow us to understand the combined impact of all the UK Government funded Challenge Fund projects. This data will therefore provide useful information for the Defra Secretariat and for Defra Ministers regarding the Challenge Fund.

The standard measures for the IWT Challenge Fund are currently under development and it is therefore not necessary, at present, to complete this Annex. Further information and guidance about the IWT standard measures will follow.

**Annex 4 Onwards – supplementary material (optional but encouraged as evidence of project achievement)**

**Checklist for submission**

	Check
<b>Is the report less than 10MB?</b> If so, please email to <a href="mailto:IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk">IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk</a> putting the project number in the subject line.	Yes
<b>Is your report more than 10MB?</b> If so, please discuss with <a href="mailto:IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk">IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk</a> about the best way to deliver the report, putting the project number in the subject line.	Yes
<b>Have you included means of verification?</b> You need not submit every project document, but the main outputs and a selection of the others would strengthen the report.	Yes
<b>Do you have hard copies of material you want to submit with the report?</b> If so, please make this clear in the covering email and ensure all material is marked with the project number.	No.
Have you involved your partners in preparation of the report and named the main contributors	Yes
Have you completed the Project Expenditure table fully?	Yes
Do not include claim forms or other communications with this report.	Yes